

March 18, 2025

The Honourable Doug Ford
Premier of Ontario
Via Email: premier@ontario.ca

The Honourable Prabmeet Sarkaria,
Minister of Transportation
Via Email: minister.mto@ontario.ca

Re: Driver Training and Examinations Auditor General Report

Please be advised the Council of the Municipality of Chatham-Kent, at its regular meeting held on March 17, 2025 supported the attached resolution, Appendix A, regarding the above noted matter from the City of Brampton.

Sincerely,

Judy Smith, CMO
Director Municipal Governance/Clerk

c
Trevor Jones, MPP
Email: trevor.jones@pc.ola.org

Steve Pinsonneault MPP
Steve.pinsonneault@pc.ola.org

Marit Stiles, MPP
Leader, Official Opposition
New Democratic Party of Ontario
MStiles-P@ndp.on.ca

Bonnie Crombie
Leader, Ontario Liberal Party
bonnie@ontarioliberal.ca

Mike Schreiner
Leader, Green Party of Ontario leader@gpo.ca

Aretha Adams, Regional Clerk
Regional Municipality of Peel
regional.clerk@peelregion.ca

Association of Municipalities of Ontario (AMO)
amo@amo.on.ca

Association of Professional Driving Instructors of Ontario (APDIO)
apdioassociation@gmail.com

Young Drivers of Canada
Brampton@yd.com / info@yd.com

Distribution List

Municipalities referenced in Clause 4:

Michael Schulthess, Clerk City
of London
cityclerk@london.ca

Amanda Fusco, Director, Legislated Services/City Clerk City of
Kitchener
amanda.fusco@kitchener.ca

John D. Elvidge
City of Toronto
clerk@toronto.ca

Diana Rusnov, Director, Legislative Services and City Clerk
City of Mississauga
diana.rusnov@mississauga.ca

Kevin Klingenberg, Director, Corporate Services, and Town Clerk Town
of Caledon
Kevin.Klingenberg@caledon.ca

Todd Coles, City Clerk
City of Vaughan (Woodbridge)
clerks@vaughan.ca

John Kennedy
City of Peterborough
clerk@peterborough.ca

Dylan McMahon, Acting General Manager/Clerk City
of Guelph
clerks@guelph.ca

Matthew Trennum, Clerk City
of Hamilton
clerk@hamilton.ca

Chris Gauthier, Clerk/Director, Clerk's Services
City of Brantford
clerks@brantford.ca

Steve Vlachodimos, Clerk City
of Windsor
clerks@citywindsor.ca

Caitlin Salter MacDonald, Clerk City
of Ottawa
caitlin.salter-macdonald@ottawa.ca

Janet Jaynes, Clerk
City of Kingston
cityclerk@cityofkingston.ca

Samantha Yew, Clerk
City of Burlington
clerks@burlington.ca

Amber Wannamaker, Clerk
Town of Bancroft clerk@bancroft.ca

Doug Irwin, Clerk
City of Belleville
communications@belleville.ca

Sheena Earl, Clerk
City of Brockville
clerk@brockville.com

Manon Levesque
City of Cornwall
clerk@cornwall.ca

Tara Lajevardi, Director, Legislative Services/Municipal Clerk
Town of East Gwillimbury
Clerks@eastgwillimbury.ca

Sonia Girard, Clerk
Town of Hawkesbury
sgirard@hawkesbury.ca

Cathie Ritchie, Clerk
City of Kawartha Lakes (Lindsay)
clerks@kawarthalakes.ca

Kimberley Kitteringham, City Clerk and Director, Legislative Services
City of Markham
clerks@markham.ca

Lisa Lyons, Director, Legislative Services/Clerk
Town of Newmarket
clerks@newmarket.ca

Raylene Martell, Clerk
Town of Orangeville
clerksdept@orangeville.ca

Mary Medeiros, Director, Legislative Services/Clerk
City of Oshawa
clerks@oshawa.ca

Victoria Charbonneau, Clerk
City of Pembroke
Victoria.charbonneau@pembroke.ca

Carolynn Errett, Clerk
Town of Renfrew
cerrett@renfrew.ca

Kerry Costello, Clerk
Town of Smith Falls
kcostello@smithsfalls.ca

Nancy Johnston, Director, Corporate Services/Clerk
Township of North Dundas (Winchester)
njohnston@northdundas.com

Wendy Cooke, City Clerk/Director, Legislative and Court Services
City of Barrie
CityClerks@barrie.ca

Rachel Anstett, Clerk
Municipality of Central Huron (Clinton)
clerk@centralhuron.com

Allyson Euler, Clerk
City of Dryden
aeuler@dryden.ca

Joseph Burke, CAO/Clerk
Town of Espanola
town@espanola.ca

Chelsea Greig,
Clerk Town of Fort Frances
cgreig@fortfrances.ca

Tanya Calleja, Clerk
Town of Huntsville
clerk@huntsville.ca

Chantal Guillemette, Clerk
Town of Kapuskasing
chantal.guillemette@kapuskasing.ca

Heather Pihulak, Director, Corporate Services/ Clerk
City of Kenora
hpihulak@kenora.ca

Jennifer Montreuil, Clerk
Town of Kirkland Lake
clerk@tkl.ca

Logan Belanger, Municipal Clerk
City of Temiskaming Shores (New Liskeard)
clerk@temiskamingshores.ca

Karen McIsaac, City Clerk
City of North Bay
karen.mcisaac@northbay.ca

Dan Kirby, Director, Council Services/City Clerk/Assistant City Solicitor
City of Orillia
clerks@orillia.ca

Briana Bloomfield, Clerk
Owen Sound
bbloomfield@owensound.ca

Rachel Tyczinski, Clerk
City of Sault Ste. Marie
cityclerk@cityssm.on.ca

Tatiana Dafoe, Clerk
City of Stratford
clerks@stratford.ca

Eric Labelle, City Solicitor and Clerk
City of Greater Sudbury
clerks@greatersudbury.ca

Krista Power, Director, Legislative Services and Clerk
City of Thunder Bay
cityclerk@thunderbay.ca

Steph Palmateer, Clerk City of
Timmins clerks@timmins.ca

Bill Matson, Clerk
City of Niagara Falls
clerk@niagarafalls.ca

Vicki Tytaneck, Clerk
Town of Oakville
townclerk@oakville.ca

Amy Burkhart, Clerk
City of Sarnia
clerks@sarnia.ca

Jonathan Magill, Clerk
County of Simcoe
clerks@simcoe.ca

Kristen Sullivan, Clerk
City of St. Catharines
clerks@stcatharines.ca

Tanya Daniels, Director, Corporate Services/Clerk
Town of Tilsonburg
clerks@tillsonburg.ca

Fiona Hamilton, Director, Legislative and Legal Services
Municipality of Brockton (Walkerton)
fhamilton@brockton.ca

Amelia Humphries, Deputy Chief Administrative Officer/ Clerk
City of Woodstock
ahumphries@cityofwoodstock.ca

Chris Harris, Director, Legislative Services and Clerk
Town of Whitby
clerk@whitby.ca

Stephen Huycke, Director, Legislative Services/Clerk
City of Richmond Hill
clerks@richmondhill.ca

Danielle Manton, Clerk
City of Cambridge
clerks@cambridge.ca

Jaclyn Grossi, Municipal Clerk
Town of Ajax
clerks@ajax.ca

Susan Cassel, Clerk
City of Pickering
clerks@pickering.ca

February 20, 2025

Sent by email**See Distribution List on page 5****Re: Driver Training and Examinations Auditor General Report**

The following recommendation of the Committee of Council Meeting of January 15, 2025 was approved by Council on January 22, 2025, pursuant to Council Resolution C027-2025:

CW009-2025**Whereas:**

- It is a relief that Premier Ford was unharmed in the accident on the 401 in Pickering involving a reckless driver (age 18) from Oshawa on January 8, 2025 (Source: <https://toronto.ctvnews.ca/ontario-premier-doug-ford-uninjured-in-highway-401-collision-says-his-office-1.7168982>)
- In addition to tragic loss of life and injury, vehicle collisions cause higher auto-insurance rates, unwanted congestion, lost productivity, and significant costs associated with emergency response (police, fire, paramedics, hospital emergency rooms and healthcare);
- According to the OPP, there were more car collision-related deaths (**568**) on Ontario highways in 2023 than in any year since 2007, making it **the deadliest year in over 15 years** and "...it's so critically important that we understand the rules of the road and we share the road safely, responsibly and understand the consequences for making a bad decision can be deadly." (Source: <https://www.cbc.ca/news/canada/toronto/opp-number-fatalities-last-year-deadly-year-1.7204528>);
- That same year 26,425 were injured in vehicle collisions according to the MTO Preliminary 2023 Ontario Road Safety Annual Report (Source: <https://www.ontario.ca/files/2024-07/mto-orsar-preliminary2023-en.pdf>)
- As of Thanksgiving 2024, the OPP notes that **296** drivers, passengers, pedestrians and cyclists died in car collisions, and the vast majority of those road incidents were preventable and attributed to poor and careless actions and behaviours (Source: <https://barrie.ctvnews.ca/nearly-300-people-missing-from-thanksgiving-tables-opp-1.7070787>), one-fifth involving a transport truck (as at July 2024 Source: <https://www.baytoday.ca/local-news/one-fifth-of-fatal-collisions-in-2024-involve-transport-trucks-9177343>)

-2-

- 2024 is the most dangerous year for pedestrians and cyclists who have been particularly at risk this year, with fatalities in these two road user classes up 100 per cent and 82 per cent respectively over this time last year (Source: <https://www.mondaq.com/canada/rail-road-cycling/1565790/how-2024-has-quickly-become-the-deadliest-year-for-cyclists-and-pedestrians>);
- By far, the most common type of conviction of the Highway Traffic Act (HTA) and cause for fatalities was speeding, representing 60.4% of all HTA convictions (Source: <https://www.g1.ca/driving-statistics/>);
- Peel Region had 25 fatalities due to car collisions - 13 in Brampton and 12 in Mississauga;
- The most dangerous places to drive in Ontario are Brantford (0.7/5), Kingston (0.7/5), Burlington (0.8/5) and Brampton (1.1/5), which impacts road safety and insurance affordability for everyone in these communities (Source: <https://www.newswire.ca/news-releases/top-10-safest-and-most-dangerous-cities-to-drive-in-ontario-in-2024-889054846.html>);
- From January to September 2024 the following traffic violation charges have been made by Peel Police:
 - 632 careless driving charges (345 in Brampton, a 25% increase compared to Jan-Sep 2023)
 - 559 cellphone use while driving charges (125 in Brampton, a 29% increase compared to Jan-Sep 2023)
 - 6,367 speeding charges (830 in Brampton, a 117% increase compared to Jan-Sep 2023)
 - 1,992 “Fail to Stop” at a stop sign charges (874 in Brampton, a 74% increase compared to Jan-Sep 2023);
- To mitigate speeding drivers, The City of Brampton has made historic investments in ASE cameras, an ASE processing centre, speed bumps, road diets, lower speed limits, police enforcement and other traffic calming measures, however like all municipalities, lacks jurisdiction over driver training and examinations, an area requiring urgent reform under the Provincial Government;
- Under the HTA, the Ministry of Transportation (Ministry) is responsible for protecting the public by restricting the privilege of driving to those who demonstrate that they have the necessary knowledge, skills and experience to drive safely;

-3-

- Ensuring that drivers receive appropriate and effective training and testing before they get a driver's licence is a crucial step in keeping Ontario's roads safe;
- The Auditor General (AG) conducted a value for money audit (AG Report) which includes 18 recommendations (***summary attached to this motion***) for the Provincial Government Ministry, published in December 2023 and concludes by highlighting:

"Our audit concluded that the Ministry of Transportation did not have effective evidence-based driver examination programs to evaluate and test novice drivers thoroughly and consistently. The Ministry did not provide effective oversight of novice driver training and driver examination service providers to ensure desired service outcomes with due regard to economy. Ministry oversight of driving schools and instructors was limited. It does not regulate driver training services outside of the optional Beginner Driver Education program, curbing its ability to identify and/or deter substandard training practices within the industry. In addition, the Ministry's monitoring programs were not designed to proactively identify drivers with repeat suspensions or high-risk medical conditions, impeding the effectiveness of these programs to maximize road safety in Ontario. (Source Page 4:

https://www.auditor.on.ca/en/content/annualreports/arreports/en23/AR_drivertraining_en23.pdf);

- In March 2024, CBC Marketplace broke an investigative story "Driving schools selling shortcuts to insurance discounts and faster road tests" where schools submit false information to government saying drivers completed 40 hours of training, consistent with concerning findings in the AG Report (Source: <https://www.cbc.ca/news/business/marketplace-driving-schools-education-fee-1.7134557>); and
- The provincial government has not provided a substantial update on any action taken regarding the recommendations in the AG Report to improve driver training and examination for safer drivers and improve safety on our roads.

Therefore be it resolved that:

1. The City Brampton endorse the Auditor General Value-for-Money Audit Driver Training and Examination Report (AG Report) - its findings and 18 recommendations to ensure that we have safe and qualified drivers on our roads; and
2. The City of Brampton share this motion and endorsement with the Premier, Minister of Transportation, all local MPPs, and the leaders of the official opposition and third party; and

-4-

3. The City of Brampton request a formal update from the provincial government and meeting with the Minister of Transportation regarding any action taken to date based on the recommendations described in the AG Report, particularly those that prioritize improved driver training and examination for safer drivers on our roads; and
4. The City of Brampton forward this motion and attachment to any cities or towns listed in the AG Report and the top dangerous cities in Ontario, encouraging them to pass a similar motion; and CC them in the follow-up correspondence to the province; and
5. The City of Brampton forward this motion, attachment, and follow-up correspondence to the Region of Peel, Peel Police, the Association of Municipalities of Ontario (AMO), Driving Instructors Association, and Young Drivers of Canada.
6. Staff report back with data to identify road safety hotspots with the intention to use the data strategically with Peel Police to improve Brampton's status as a safe city to drive.
7. Staff report back on bylaw enforcement tactics regarding driving instructors as referenced on page 22 of the AG Report: "In some municipalities, such as Brampton, municipal bylaw officers patrolled test routes and issued fines to driving instructors who lingered around exam routes".

A summary of recommendations in the Auditor General Value-for-Money Audit Driver Training and Examination Report is attached.

By copy of this correspondence to Robert Higgs, Director, Enforcement and By-law Services, Legislative Services, and Shane Loftus, Director, Road Maintenance and Operations, Public Works and Engineering, they are requested to carry out the directions outlined in clauses 6 and 7. Item **RM 5/2025** has been added to the Referred Matters List for the report requested.

Yours truly,

Sonya Pacheco

Sonya Pacheco
Legislative Coordinator, City Clerk's Office
Tel: 905-874-2178
sonya.pacheco@brampton.ca

(CW – 7.2)

MOTION: SAFER DRIVERS = SAFER ROADS, a call for the Provincial Government to act**Moved by: Santos****ATTACHMENT: Summary of recommendations published by the Auditor General Value – “Value-for-Money Audit: Driver Training and Examination” December 2023***NOTE: The following list of recommendations have been copied directly from the report.***Issue and Recommendations (Pg16-38)**https://www.auditor.on.ca/en/content/annualreports/arreports/en23/AR_drivertraining_en23.pdf:**4.1 Driver Examinations****4.1.1 Novice Drivers from Urban Areas Who Took Road Tests at Rural or Suburban Drive Test Centres Were Involved in More Collisions**

1. So that driver examinations effectively assess whether novice drivers are sufficiently prepared to drive safely on Ontario’s roads, we recommend that the Ministry of Transportation:
 - assess the impact on road safety of novice drivers from urban areas taking their road tests at rural and suburban DriveTest Centres; and
 - based on that assessment, identify and put in place reasonable restrictions that prohibit urban novice drivers from taking their road test at a DriveTest Centre outside of where they live, work or study.

4.1.2 Ministry Reduced the Requirements for the G (Highway) Road Test Without a Full Review and Formal Evaluation of Road Safety Impacts

2. To understand the full impact of the reduced G (highway) road test and make evidence-based decisions about the reduced test, we recommend that the Ministry of Transportation:
 - conduct a thorough policy analysis of the impact of the reduced G (highway) road test, including the impact related to drivers from countries with no reciprocal driver’s licence exchange agreement with Ontario;
 - track and compare the collision rates of drivers who pass the reduced G (highway) road test to those who passed the full G (highway) road test over a sufficient period of time to determine if it increases road safety risk; and
 - based on these analyses, determine whether it is appropriate to continue to use the reduced G (highway) road test.

4.1.3 Novice Drivers Can Repeat the Knowledge Test as Many Times as Necessary in One Sitting to Pass

3. To encourage novice drivers to study the rules of the road more effectively prior to attempting the G1 knowledge test, we recommend that the Ministry of Transportation review best practices in other jurisdictions, such as Quebec and British Columbia, and determine whether it should introduce a wait period before an individual can retake the test or limit the number of tests that can be taken in a single day.

4.2 Driver Training**4.2.1 Drivers Allowed to Shorten Their G1 Supervised Driving Period Were Involved in More Collisions**

4. So that novice drivers are better prepared to drive safely on Ontario’s roads, we recommend that the Ministry of Transportation:
 - review and identify opportunities to enhance the effectiveness of the Beginner Driver Education program (program) for novice drivers, including the sufficiency of the existing minimum number of driving practice hours;
 - based on leading practices in other jurisdictions, reassess the time discount provision that allows novice drivers to shorten the supervised driving period after the completion of the program;

Continued 4 of 7

MOTION: SAFER DRIVERS = SAFER ROADS, a call for the Provincial Government to act**Moved by: Santos**

- based on its review of these areas, implement necessary changes to improve the program; and subsequent to making changes to the program, determine whether all novice drivers should be required to complete the program.

4.2.2 Ministry Provided Limited Guidance Regarding Necessary Driving Practices for New Drivers Compared to Other Jurisdictions

5. So that novice drivers are well prepared to drive safely on Ontario roads, and to protect the integrity of the Ministry's driver examination process, we recommend that the Ministry of Transportation:
- review the types of driver training services available in the marketplace (including the practice of route training) and assess their impact on novice drivers and on the integrity of the driver examination process;
 - based on that assessment, propose regulatory changes to prohibit driver training services that compromise the Ministry's ability to assess the driving skills of novice drivers through the Ministry examination process; and
 - implement monitoring and enforcement tools to deter prohibited driver training services.

4.2.3 Unregulated Driver Training Services May Undermine the Integrity of Driver Examinations

4.2.4 Weak Oversight of Beginner Driver Education Driving Schools

6. To strengthen the oversight of driving schools, we recommend that the Ministry of Transportation:
- develop and implement a formal policy to require timely on-site follow-ups at driving schools where audits identified either serious or a high number of compliance violations to assess if the violations have been resolved;
 - develop and implement a strategy for routinely conducting cost-effective mystery shops on driving schools that it identifies as high-risk; and
 - regularly document and assess progress reported through follow-ups with driving schools to direct the Ministry's future oversight and enforcement actions.

4.3 Graduated Licensing System May Not Adequately Prepare Less-Experienced Drivers from Other Countries to Drive in Ontario

7. To better prepare novice drivers from other countries for driving in Ontario, we recommend that the Ministry of Transportation:
- research whether drivers from other countries have unique challenges that may contribute to their involvement in a higher proportion of collisions;
 - reassess the impact of waiving the 12-month wait period between the G1 (knowledge) and G2 (city) road test; and
 - based on the results of Ministry research and reassessment, make necessary changes to the training and examination programs.

4.4 Monitoring High-Risk Licensed Drivers

4.4.1 Ministry Rarely Requires Drivers with Repeat Driving Suspensions to Take Retraining Courses

8. To encourage road safety and provide early remedial measures for drivers with a history of repeat driving offences and suspensions, we recommend that the Ministry of Transportation:
- routinely identify drivers with a record of repeat driving offences and suspensions who Ministry data indicates are at increased likelihood to cause a collision; and
 - expand the criteria for requiring drivers to complete remediation and retraining to include these drivers.

MOTION: SAFER DRIVERS = SAFER ROADS, a call for the Provincial Government to act**Moved by: Santos**

4.4.2 Elderly Drivers' Ability to Drive Safely Not Effectively Assessed

9. To enhance road safety for the growing number of elderly drivers, we recommend the Ministry of Transportation review and adopt best practices from other jurisdictions, such as:
- re-examining elderly drivers' driving skills; and
 - requiring regular medical assessments for all Drivers 80 and older.

4.4.3 Reporting of Drivers Who May Be Medically Unfit to Drive Could Be Improved

10. For more complete and timely identification, assessment and suspension of drivers with high medical risks, we recommend that the Ministry of Transportation periodically conduct educational and outreach initiatives to increase awareness among doctors, nurses and optometrists to report patients for medical assessment.

4.4.4 Supporting Evidence for Ministry's Medical Suspension Decisions Not Always Complete

11. To help ensure that decisions to suspend driver's licences are based on all medically relevant information, and that the suspension decisions are consistent and adequately supported, we recommend that the Ministry of Transportation:
- redesign the forms doctors use to provide condition-specific medical information to the Ministry to include all necessary information, such as test or treatment results;
 - require medical assessors to consistently document their rationale for decisions related to complex driving suspensions and reinstatements; and
 - implement a quality-assurance process to routinely review the completeness and appropriateness of medical assessments.

4.5 Driver Examination Services Contract Management and Oversight*4.5.1 Ministry's Contract Administration Was Ineffective, and Failed to Improve Driver Examination Services for Ontarians*

12. To better motivate the service provider to improve service rather than incur penalties, and to hold the service provider accountable for contract deliverables, we recommend that the Ministry of Transportation:
- design and implement performance measures that incorporate effective penalties for performance failures, including delays in contract deliverables;
 - collect an upfront contingency deposit for performance penalties based on historical records; and
 - design and implement incentives (in addition to penalties) to promote compliance and appropriate responses from the service provider.

13. To promote effective contract management and relations between the Ministry of Transportation and its service provider, and to avoid undermining the contractual position of the Ministry, we recommend that the Ministry ensure that communications with contractors use appropriate contract channels.

4.5.2 Ministry's Compliance Audits of Driver Examination Services Were Inconsistent and Incomplete

14. To better monitor and report on the driver examination service provider's compliance and performance, we recommend that the Ministry of Transportation strengthen its audit function by implementing a program of risk-based audits to examine all key operational processes of driver examination services, including road tests.

MOTION: SAFER DRIVERS = SAFER ROADS, a call for the Provincial Government to act**Moved by: Santos**

4.5.3 Ministry Paid Additional Funds to Maintain Service Levels That Were the Responsibility of the Service Provider

15. To provide for better accountability of funds provided to third parties for driver examination services to Ontarians, we recommend that the Ministry of Transportation:

- administer contracts such that risks and costs are allocated between the parties in accordance with contractual terms; and
- conduct thorough reviews on all relief, subsidization or reimbursement requests from service providers and render decisions that are consistent with the Ministry's contractual obligations.

4.5.4 Ministry Awarded New Contract to the Service Provider Despite Poor Performance and Issues of Concern

16. To provide for more effective oversight of driver examination service providers, and to provide Ontarians with better quality of service, we recommend that the Ministry of Transportation:

- ensure adequate lead time to comply with government policies on procurement when contracting with a service provider;
- consider past performance in negotiating future contracts;
- compare its experience relative to other Canadian provinces to identify best practices in structuring driver examination services; and
- use independent research to immediately evaluate the costs and benefits of various options for an examination service delivery partnership.

4.6 Ministry Overrode Its Own Proof of Identification Requirements When Issuing Driver's Licences

17. To better prevent fraud and identify theft, we recommend that the Ministry of Transportation:

- develop internal guidelines and formal procedures to evaluate and document the extenuating circumstances for ID escalations;
- educate Serco and ServiceOntario staff on these guidelines and procedures; and
- put in place a process to monitor that these guidelines and procedures are followed.

4.7 Ministry Did Not Incorporate Key Safety Data When Determining the Effectiveness of Its Road Safety Programs

18. To measure the effectiveness of its driver training and examination programs on a timely basis, we recommend that the Ministry of Transportation:

- expand the use of business intelligence tools to conduct additional analytics that leverage data from related information systems, linking driver information to the driver examination, collisions and driver medical databases;
- establish a comprehensive set of road safety indicators, including those related to collision rates, based on the objectives of its driver training and examination programs; and
- monitor its driver training and examination programs using these indicators, and report on the results annually.