



Report

Subject: Update on the York Street Heritage Conservation District Request

Department: Infrastructure Services

Division: Planning

Report #: INS-2024-062

Meeting Date: 2024-12-16

Recommendations

That report INS-2024-062, Update on the York Street Heritage Conservation District Request, be received; and

That staff continue with the York Street Heritage Conservation District (HCD) process and report back with a project work plan and budget for an HCD Study and Plan in February 2025; and

That staff identify a preferred approach to reviewing the Municipal Non-Designated Heritage Registry properties in February 2025.

Overview

In response to requests from residents in the York Street area to pursue a Heritage Conservation District (HCD) designation of this neighbourhood, and in receipt of a staff report in consideration of such, Council directed staff (via Resolution No. 2024-093) to retain a heritage consultant to review the York Street portion of the 2016-2018 Merchants and Prince of Whales HCD proposal to: i) determine if the area meets prescribed HCD criteria; and ii) recommend a preferred approach for designation.

Staff retained consultants SGL Planning and Design Inc. (SGL) and Stantec Consulting Ltd. (Stantec) to provide planning and heritage consulting support services respectively on an as-needed basis. One of the first assignments for the Consulting team was to evaluate the York Street neighbourhood per Council's resolution. Stantec has conducted a high-level review of the 2016-2018 HCD as it relates to the York Street area and determined the following:

- i) To meet the threshold for an HCD under the Ontario Heritage Act (OHA) and Ontario Regulation 9/06, 25% of the properties, or 7 of the 25 properties with

- structures fronting onto York Street, would need to meet two or more prescribed criteria for HCD designation
- ii) Much of the previous work can be used as a basis for the HCD study of York Street, but will need to be scoped and updated based on changes in the study area and recent legislative changes.
 - iii) The policies and guidelines for managing change within the broader 2016-2018 study area may no longer be applicable to the York Street area, but can be adapted based on the current planning policy context and consultation through the HCD process.

In considering the designation options for the area, i.e. individual property designations or an HCD, Stantec determined the following:

- i) Individual property designations may not be as cost-effective due to more detailed property-specific research needed for each property.
- iv) Individual designation governs alterations on the specific property, tying back to its identified heritage value, while an HCD provides a framework for managing change within the overall area, with a focus on attributes of the district, or features that contribute to the character of the district, rather than each individual property.
- v) Multiple individual property designations are eligible for individual/separate appeals, while an HCD has only one appeal period, but any appeal could affect the entire HCD coming into effect.

To move forward with the HCD process, Stantec will prepare a detailed work plan and budget to undertake an HCD Study and Plan for Council consideration in January 2025.

Council's resolution also directed staff to hire a heritage planning student to review the Municipal non-designated Heritage Registry for individual property designation. Staff have worked with Heritage Orangeville members to update and correct property information on the Registry. Staff and the Consulting team will meet in Q1 2025 to determine a preferred approach and recommended research methodology for having a heritage student review the Registry.

Background

Following direction from Council in (report INS-2024-032, *York Street Heritage Conservation District Request*) staff retained SGL Planning and Design Inc. (SGL) and Stantec Consulting Ltd. (Stantec) to provide planning and heritage consulting support services on an as-needed, standing offer basis. Staff met with members of SGL and Stantec in October 2024 to discuss the York Street Heritage Conservation District (HCD) Request and provide background information to the consultant team. Based on these discussions, SGL and Stantec have reviewed the available background information to consider the York Street HCD Study.

Analysis/Current Situation

York Street HCD Review

The York Street area under HCD consideration contains approximately 25 properties with structures fronting on York Street, including one property designated under Part IV of the OHA. To meet the threshold for an HCD under the OHA, an area is required to contain 25% of properties that meet two or more criteria of *Ontario Regulation (O. Reg.) 9/06*. For the York Street area to meet this threshold, seven or more properties would need to meet two or more criteria.

Stantec conducted a high-level review of the Merchants and Prince of Wales HCD Study prepared in 2017/2018 which includes the York Street area. It was determined that this subsection of the potential district demonstrates a high potential to meet the required threshold of 25% of properties that meet two or more criteria of O. Reg. 9/06. The street contains a residential streetscape with structures predominantly one and one half to two and one half storeys in height, clad with red brick, and representative of a variety of late-19th and early 20th century architectural styles or influences.

Stantec's review to date notes that the previous HCD Study provided a comprehensive review of the policy framework, history, and development of the previous Study Areas alongside review of the existing conditions including urban form, streetscape, and built environment. Much of the material from the previous HCD Study can be used as a foundation for an HCD Study for York Street, but will need to be scoped to the specific area and adapted or updated based on the change in Study Area. In addition, changes to the legislative framework that have occurred with changes to the OHA would be required.

Stantec notes that the HCD Plan previously prepared contained policies and guidelines for a broader area and building types that may no longer be applicable to the York Street Area, should an HCD Plan proceed. However, many of the existing policies and guidelines for alterations or additions to residential properties, new construction, demolition, landscape/streetscaping, and public realm could be adapted for the York Street Area with subsequent update or revision based on public consultation and review of the current planning policy context.

The following tasks would be beneficial to undertake an HCD Study and Plan for York Street:

HCD Study Phase

- Detailed review of the existing Study Report, including property inventory and associated historical research (where available)
- Update and refinement of historical background information from the Previous HCD so that it is relevant to York Street, expanding where necessary
- Update of inventory for York Street properties to include:

- Current photography
 - High level description of property to identify building type, height, dominant materials, architectural style
 - High level historical review based on known historical ownership from previous Study or Heritage Register information
 - Evaluation of property according to O. Reg. 9/06 Criteria
 - Identification of “Contributing” or “Non-contributing” Status based on evaluation results
- Refinement of HCD objectives and recommended planning policy changes
 - Consultation with the public and Heritage Committee
 - Presentation of findings and recommendations to Council

HCD Plan Phase

- Review existing HCD Plan document
- Update and refine policies and guidelines based on residential context
- Update mapping, photographs, and graphics
- Consultation with the public and Heritage Orangeville, including one Statutory Public Meeting
- Presentation to Council

Consideration could also be given to individual Part IV designation, but it may not be as cost effective as an HCD, as more detailed historical research, evaluation, and statements of Cultural Heritage Value or Interest would need to be prepared for each individual property. Each individual property designation would have its own independent appeal period, rather than a single appeal period that is part of the HCD process. Although there could be multiple appeals for separate individual property designations, there is only one appeal period for the HCD, but any appeal could affect the entire HCD coming into effect. An HCD would require less research, though at a higher level and would focus more on the relationship of the properties on York Street to each other and their broader context within Orangeville.

Individual designation would govern the specific alteration of heritage attributes within each individual property, which relate back to its identified cultural heritage value or interest. This would typically be elements such as form, massing, building materials, and architectural details.

An HCD would provide a framework for managing change in the area with a focus on the attributes of the HCD rather than each individual property. Attributes of an HCD usually include physical features of the built form that contribute to the character of an

area, such as the general height and massing, historic building types, and materials or decorative details characteristic of the contributing architectural styles. HCD attributes also often include landscape and streetscape elements that contribute to the character of an area, and as such policies and guidelines in an HCD can manage change both to built form and other attributes such as mature tree canopy, landscaping, and public realm.

To move forward with the HCD process, Stantec will prepare a work plan and budget for the January 27th Council meeting.

Heritage Register Review

Council directed staff to hire a Heritage Planning Student to review the Municipal Non-Designated Registry properties to identify priority properties for Part IV designation under the Ontario Heritage Act (OHA). Staff have worked with Heritage Orangeville members to update and consolidate property information on the Town's Municipal Heritage Register to ensure that a further review of properties is efficient and accurate. Staff are also developing format for screening and identifying properties that may meet eligibility criteria for designation.

Staff and Stantec will meet in Q1 of 2025 to determine the preferred approach to the Town's hire of a Heritage Planning Student to review the Municipal Register of Non-Designated Registry properties. The consultant team suggests completing a review and "triage" strategy in consultation with Staff and the Heritage committee early in Q1 2025 to provide a framework for and timeline for prioritization. Stantec will also work with Staff and the Heritage Committee to provide a sample template for research, evaluation, statement of significance and heritage attributes on which to form a designating by-law for properties that meet two or more criteria and are eligible for designation.

Corporate Implications

Council Resolution No. 2024-093 directed staff to retain the expertise of a Heritage expert to conduct a review of the York Street portion of the 2017-2018 HCD study area to determine if York Street warrants an HCD designation and recommend a preferred designation approach. Council also directed staff to hire a planning student to review the Municipal Non-Designated Heritage Registry properties to determine which should be pursued for designation.

Should Council direct Staff to continue to pursue an HCD Study and Plan for York Street, staff will put together detailed cost estimates following preparation of a Work Plan and discussion between Staff and the Consulting team, targeting January 2025. The Town's 2025 operating budget includes a provision of \$28,000 in the Heritage

Orangeville committee budget and there is an additional \$30,000 consulting budget in the Planning division that could be used for this work, if required.

Conclusion

Based on the cursory review undertaken by the Consulting team, the York Street neighbourhood is an appropriate candidate for an HCD designation. Staff and the Consulting team will report back to Council in January 2025 with a detailed work plan and anticipated budget to undertake an HCD Study and Plan to establish an HCD for the York Street neighbourhood.

Strategic Alignment

Strategic Plan

Strategic Goal: Future-Readiness

Objective: Confirm applicable governance and policy regimes

Sustainable Neighbourhood Action Plan

Theme: Economic Development and Culture

Strategy: Further establish Orangeville's identity through the preservation and expansion of tourism, culture and heritage.

Notice Provisions

There are no public notification provisions applicable to this report.

Respectfully submitted,

Tim Kocialek, P.Eng., PMP
General Manager, Infrastructure Services

Reviewed by:

Brandon Ward, MCIP, RPP
Manager of Planning,

Prepared by:

Lashia Jones MA, CAHP
Senior Cultural Heritage Specialist
Stantec Consulting Ltd.

Attachment(s): None